

Published on *How does law protect in war? - Online casebook* (https://casebook.icrc.org)
Home > Indiscriminate attacks

An attack of a nature to strike military objectives [1] and civilians [2] or civilian objects [3] without discrimination, i.e. an attack which

- a. is not directed at a specific military objective (or person);
- b. employs a method [4] or means of warfare [5] which cannot be directed at a specific military objective (or person); or
- c. employs a method or means of combat the effects of which cannot be limited as required by international humanitarian law.

Indiscriminate attacks are prohibited and include:

- a. an attack by bombardment [6], by any means or method which treats as a single military objective a number of clearly separated and distinct military objectives located in a city, town, village or other area containing similar concentration of civilians [2] or civilian objects;
- b. an attack which may be expected to cause incidental loss of civilian life, injury to civilians, damage to civilian objects, or a combination thereof, which would be excessive in relation to the tangible and direct military advantage [7] anticipated.

### **OUTLINE**

Chapter 9, II. 6. c) indiscriminate attacks [8]

## **LEGAL SOURCE**

# **General prohibition** CIHL, 11 [9] attacks not directed at a specific military objective PI, 51/4(a) [10] CIHL, 12a [11] use of weapons which cannot be directed at a specific military objective PI, 51/4(b) [10] CIHL, 12b [11] treating different military objectives as a single military objective PI, 51/5(a) [10] CIHL, 13 [12]

principle of proportionality (See also Proportionality [13])

PI, 51/5(b) [10]

CIHL, 14 [14]

# **CASES**

```
ICRC, The Challenges of Contemporary Armed Conflicts [15]
ICJ, Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion [16] (Para. 43 [16])
Israel, Operation Cast Lead [17] (Part II, paras 120-126 [18], 230-232 [19], 365-392 [20]
Israel, The Targeted Killings Case [21] (Paras 40-46 [21])
Israel, Human Rights Committee's Report on Beit Hanoun [22] (Para. 34, 38-42 [22]
Israel/Lebanon/Hezbollah, Conflict in 2006 [23] (Part I, [24] Paras. 116-117 [25], 140-
148 [26])
South Africa, Sagarius and Others [27]
ICRC, Iran/Iraq Memoranda [28]
Iran/Iraq, UN Security Council Assessing Violations of International
Humanitarian Law [29]
United States/United Kingdom, Report on the Conduct of the Persian Gulf War
[30]
United States/United Kingdom, Conduct of the 2003 War in Iraq [31]
```

Iraq, Use of Force by United States Forces in Occupied Iraq [32]

ICTY, The Prosecutor v. Martic [33] (Part B, Paras 303-313 [34], 461-463 [35], 470 and 472 [36]; Part C, 248 [37])

ICTY, The Prosecutor v. Kupreskic et al. [38] (Para. 526 [38])

ICTY, The Prosecutor v. Galic [39] (Part A, paras 57-61 [40] and 372-387 [41])

Federal Republic of Yugoslavia, NATO Intervention [42] (Part A., paras 4, 18-19 [43] and Part B., paras 75-78 [44])

Afghanistan, Drug Dealers as Legitimate Targets [45]

Afghanistan, Goatherd Saved from Attack [46]

Afghanistan, Assessment of ISAF Strategy [47]

Civil War in Nepal [48] (Part II. [48])

ECHR, Isayeva v. Russia [49]

Georgia/Russia, Human Rights Watch's Report on the Conflict in South Ossetia [50] (Paras 21-22 [51], 28-30 [52], 41-47 [53] & 65-74 [54])

Georgia/Russia, Independent International Fact-Finding Mission on the Conflict in South Ossetia [55] (Paras 66-67 & 71-73 [55])

Iran, Victim of Cyber warfare [56]

The armed conflict in Syria [57]

ICTY, The Prosecutor v. Gotovina and Marka? [58]

Autonomous Weapon Systems [59]

Libya, NATO Intervention 2011 [60]

ICRC, International Humanitarian Law and the challenges of contemporary armed conflicts in 2015 [61] (paras 245 [62], 255 [63], 256 [64], 261 [65], 291-292 [66])

Israel/Palestine, Operation Protective Edge (Gaza, 13 June - 26 August 2014) [67]

Syria, Report by UN Commission of Inquiry (March 2017) [68]

Syria, the Battle for Aleppo [69]

ICRC, Statement - War in Cities; What is at Stake? [70]

Eastern Ukraine, OHCHR Report on the Situation: November 2016 - February 2017 [71]

Libya, Use of cluster bombs [72]

Kenya, Civilian Carnage [73]

### **BIBLIOGRAPHIC RESOURCES**

#### **Suggested readings:**

BLIX Hans, "Area Bombardment: Rules and Reasons", in *BYIL*, Vol. 49, 1978, pp. 31-69.

CASSESE Antonio, "The Prohibition of Indiscriminate Means of Warfare", in AKKERMAN Robert J. (ed.), *Declarations on Principles, A Quest for Universal Peace, Liber Amicorum Discipulorumque Prof. Dr Bert V.A. Röling*, Leiden, 1977, pp. 171-194.

DOWNES Alexander B., *Targeting Civilians in War*, Ithaca, London, Cornell University Press, 2008, 315 pp.

MEYROWITZ Henri, "Le bombardement stratégique d'après le Protocol I aux Conventions de Genève", in *ZaöRV*, Vol. 41, 1981, pp. 1-68.

#### **Further readings:**

AUBERT Maurice, "The International Committee of the Red Cross and the Problem of Excessively Injurious or Indiscriminate Weapons", in *IRRC*, No. 279, November-December 1990, pp. 477-497.

BRETTON Philippe, "La Convention du 10 avril 1981 sur l'interdiction ou la limitation de certaines armes classiques qui peuvent être considérées comme produisant des effets traumatiques excessifs ou comme frappant sans discrimination", in *AFDI*, 1981, pp. 127-146.

CARNAHAN Burrus, "Linebacker II' and Protocol I: The Convergence of Law

and Professionalism", in *American University Law Review*, Vol. 31/4, 1982, pp. 861-870.

PARKS William H., "Conventional Aerial Bombing and the Law of War", in *United States Naval Institute Proceedings*, Vol. 108, No. 951, 1982, pp. 98-117.

PARKS William H., "Linebacker and the Law of War", in *Air University Review*, January-February 1983, pp. 2-30.

**Source URL:** https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/indiscriminate-attacks

#### Links

- [1] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/military-objectives
- [2] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/civilians
- [3] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/civilian-objects
- [4] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/methods-warfare
- [5] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/means-warfare
- [6] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/bombardment
- [7] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/military-advantage
- [8] https://casebook.icrc.org/law/conduct-hostilities#ii\_6\_c
- [9] https://www.icrc.org/customary-ihl/eng/docs/v1\_rul\_rule11

[10]

- [11] https://www.icrc.org/customary-ihl/eng/docs/v1\_rul\_rule12
- [12] https://www.icrc.org/customary-ihl/eng/docs/v1\_rul\_rule13
- [13] https://casebook.icrc.org/glossary/proportionality
- [14] https://www.icrc.org/customary-ihl/eng/docs/v1\_rul\_rule14
- [15] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-ihl-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts
- [16] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icj-nuclear-weapons-advisory-opinion#para\_43
- [17] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israelgaza-operation-cast-lead
- [18] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israelgaza-operation-cast-lead#para\_120
- [19] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israelgaza-operation-cast-lead#part\_2\_para\_230
- [20] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israelgaza-operation-cast-lead#part\_ii\_para\_365
- [21] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israel-targeted-killings-case#para\_40
- [22] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israel-human-rights-committees-report-beit-hanoun#para\_34

- [23] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israellebanonhezbollah-conflict-2006
- [24] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israellebanonhezbollah-conflict-2006#part\_i
- [25] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israellebanonhezbollah-conflict-2006#part\_i\_para\_116
- $[26] \ http://http://www.icrc.org/casebook/doc/case-study/israel-lebanon-hezbollah-conflict-case-study.htm\#part\_i\_para\_140$
- [27] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/south-africa-sagarius-and-others
- [28] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-iraniraq-memoranda
- [29] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/iraniraq-un-security-council-assessing-violations-international-humanitarian-law
- [30] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/united-statesunited-kingdom-report-conduct-persian-gulf-war
- [31] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/united-statesunited-kingdom-conduct-2003-war-iraq
- [32] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/iraq-use-force-united-states-forces-occupied-iraq
- [33] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-martic
- [34] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-martic#part\_b\_para\_303
- [35] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-martic#part\_b\_para\_461
- [36] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-martic#part\_b\_para\_470
- [37] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-martic#part\_c\_248
- [38] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-kupreskic-et-al#para\_526
- [39] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-galic
- [40] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-galic#part\_a\_para\_57
- [41] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icty-prosecutor-v-galic#para\_372
- [42] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/federal-republic-yugoslavia-nato-intervention
- [43] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/federal-republic-yugoslavia-nato-intervention#part\_a\_para\_4
- [44] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/federal-republic-yugoslavia-nato-intervention#part\_b\_para\_75
- [45] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/afghanistan-drug-dealers-legitimate-targets
- [46] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/afghanistan-goatherd-saved-attack
- [47] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/afghanistan-assessment-isaf-strategy
- [48] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/civil-war-nepal#part\_ii
- [49] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/echr-isayeva-v-russia
- [50] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/georgiarussia-independent-international-fact-finding-mission-conflict-south-ossetia
- [51] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/georgiarussia-human-rights-watchs-report-conflict-south-ossetia#para\_21
- [52] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/georgiarussia-human-rights-watchs-report-conflict-south-ossetia#para\_28
- [53] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/georgiarussia-human-rights-watchs-report-conflict-south-ossetia#para\_41
- [54] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/georgiarussia-human-rights-watchs-report-conflict-south-ossetia#para\_65
- [55] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/georgiarussia-independent-international-fact-finding-mission-conflict-

- south-ossetia#para\_66
- [56] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/iran-victim-cyber-warfare
- [57] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/armed-conflict-syria
- [58] https://www.icrc.org/casebook/doc/case-study/icty-the-prosecutor-v-gotovina-and-markac.htm
- [59] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/autonomous-weapon-systems
- [60] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/libya-nato-intervention-2011
- [61] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-international-humanitarian-law-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts-2015
- [62] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-international-humanitarian-law-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts-2015#challenges-2015-para245
- [63] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-international-humanitarian-law-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts-2015#challenges-2015-para255
- [64] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-international-humanitarian-law-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts-2015#challenges-2015-para256
- [65] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-international-humanitarian-law-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts-2015#challenges-2015-para261
- [66] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-international-humanitarian-law-and-challenges-contemporary-armed-conflicts-2015#challenges-2015-para291
- [67] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/israelpalestine-operation-protective-edge-gaza-13-june-26-august-2014
- [68] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/syria-report-un-commission-inquiry-march-2017
- [69] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/syria-battle-aleppo
- [70] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/icrc-statement-war-cities-what-stake
- [71] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/eastern-ukraine-ohchr-report-situation-november-2016-february-2017
- [72] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/libya-use-cluster-bombs
- [73] https://casebook.icrc.org/case-study/kenya-civilian-carnage